

**BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
MINUTES**

The Board of Architectural Review held its regularly scheduled meeting on Thursday, June 4, 2015, at 4:00p.m. in Council Chambers, Rouss City Hall, 15 North Cameron Street, Winchester, Virginia.

POINTS OF ORDER:

PRESENT: Chairman Rockwood, Vice Chairman Bandyke, Mr. Serafin, Mr. Walker, Ms. Jackson, Ms. Elgin, Ms. Schroth

ABSENT: None

STAFF: Josh Crump, Erick Moore, Carolyn Barrett

VISITORS: Timothy Machado, Jonathan Sladek, Sam Simpson, Jeff Davis, Richard Bell, Richard Hunt

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Chairman Rockwood called for corrections or additions to the minutes of May 21, 2015. Hearing none, he called for a motion. Vice Chairman Bandyke moved to approve the minutes as submitted. Mr. Walker seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 5-0. Chairman Rockwood abstained.

CONSENT AGENDA:

None

NEW BUSINESS:

BAR-15-303 Request of Timothy Machado for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add a new railing system at 431 Fairmont Avenue.

Mr. Machado explained that there are existing posts covered with vinyl wrap and he would like to remove it and expose the old posts, put a cap on top and run cable railing in between. Currently, the porch railing hides the house and he would like to expose more of the gambrel style. He wants more visibility of the house. The deck is made of pressure treated wood and Trex and was there when he purchased the house. Vice Chairman Bandyke stated he had no problem with what Mr. Machado would like to do. Mr. Machado said he would have Mr. Grisdale look at and approve the color he wanted to use. Mr. Walker asked if he was going to stain or paint the pressure treated wood. Mr. Machado said he would have to paint over what was there and would probably paint to match. Mr. Walker asked if he would use the same material if he had to replace anything and Mr. Machado said he would.

*Vice Chairman Bandyke made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR-15-303** to remove the vinyl railing; paint the pressure treated sub-railing and install a stainless steel cable rail system. The porch step and railing system will be relocated five feet to the south side and any material used will be pressure treated. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0.*

BAR-15-304 Request of Cheryl Anderson for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remodel the façade at 118-120 North Loudoun Street, the Winchester Hiram Lodge.

Applicant was not present.

*Mr. Walker made a motion to table **BAR-15-304** until the next meeting. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0.*

BAR-15-308 Request of Jonathan Sladek for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an accessory building at 436 Lafayette Place.

Mr. Sladek explained that his shop on North Cameron Street had closed and he needed a place to store his tools. He used all reclaimed wood siding and windows to build his shed. Vice Chairman Bandyke said the only issue he had was with the asphalt shingles. Mr. Sladek said he matched them with what was on his house. He scaled down the shed to have the same dimensions as his house. Vice Chairman Bandyke said it was considered a new structure even though it was constructed to look like an old structure. He outlined the rules for roofing materials in the Historic District. Mr. Sladek said he would have done a metal roof if his house had a metal roof. He had to put the shingles up in order to protect his tools inside the shed.

Board members asked questions about the foundation and the materials to be used around the outside of it. Mr. Sladek asked about fencing around his property. He has had several intruders and would like to protect his property better. Chairman Rockwood said the Board could work with him on fencing if it is visible from the public right-of-way. The Zoning office could provide guidelines for construction of one.

The Board members asked questions about visibility of the building from the public right-of-way. Vice Chairman Bandyke asked Ms. Schroth, since she had seen the building, how prominent the roof of the shed is from the right-of-way. She stated that if you are coming down the street from either direction, it is not visible until you are right in front of it. The trees surrounding it are pine so it is not visible during the winter. Chairman Rockwood said if they required a metal roof, it would not have any relation to other structures around it.

*Mr. Serafin made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR-15-308** using half round gutters and having paint colors approved through the Zoning Department. The foundation is to be parged or covered with stone. Shingles are approved as submitted. Vice Chairman Bandyke seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0.*

BAR-15-310 Request of Sam Simpson for a Certificate of Appropriateness to change the windows, roof and exterior paint at 210 South Washington Street.

Mr. Simpson stated that he was unaware his house was in the historic district until he found a notice on his door. He said he had tried to stay within the period the house was built. There were already some vinyl windows in the home when he had bought it. Some of them were nailed shut. One had a cut out for an air conditioner. He was unaware it was inappropriate to use vinyl windows.

The Board members asked questions about the location of the windows and which had been replaced. Mr. Simpson said he had replaced all but one window. He tried to keep the same look of the home. Vice Chairman Bandyke asked how long Mr. Simpson had owned the home. Mr. Simpson said he bought the home in November 2014 and started the project January 1, 2015. Vice Chairman Bandyke asked if there was any indication when he bought the house that it was in the Historic District. Mr. Simpson said none of the paperwork he received said anything about it. His neighbors had complimented him on bringing the house back to life but they never said anything to him. He did not know until he found the red notice on his door. He received the postcard from the City eight days before he was given the notice.

Chairman Rockwood said this situation has happened before with other properties. People do renovations without actual knowledge of the policies of the Board. The Board has drawn a firm line on it. Mr. Crump said the guidelines discourage the use of vinyl but they are just guidelines and are there for their accommodation. Vice Chairman Bandyke said he wanted to go on record that vinyl windows are unacceptable in the Historic District. They have never approved vinyl windows. If they disapprove them and City Council makes a decision to reverse it that is their decision. The Board does not accept PVC, composite or vinyl windows. They are efficient, long-lasting products but they are not included in the Historic District. If these windows are approved, it will start a precedent. Mr. Simpson said he kept the same look as the original windows. Chairman Rockwood said he agreed and from the street, it was hard to distinguish. The problem is not all houses are situated like his and it is a recurring problem that comes before the Board. He wondered if replacing the front windows would keep the spirit of the District.

Mr. Simpson said he had put a lot of work into a home that needed it and thought he had done a great job. He apologized for not following procedure and wanted to straighten it out and try to comply with what the Board wanted.

Mr. Serafin said the windows that could be seen from the street should be replaced. If he had brought the project to them beforehand, they would have rejected the vinyl windows. Mr. Simpson asked how home owners are made aware their home is in the Historic District. He has not had anything since the postcard. Chairman Rockwood said if you were going to buy a property anywhere, one of the things that should be looked at is the zoning and where the property lies. A question that should be asked is what are the zoning requirements on a parcel. Mr. Simpson said in the past he has not needed permits for a roof, paint colors or windows until he found out he was in the Historic District. He said Mr. Crump had given him the literature for the District and he is now aware. However, he will be losing money with having to replace the windows. Chairman Rockwood said if he had brought this project before them before starting work, they would have told him what type of windows to use and given him guidance. The Board agreed he had done a nice job on the house. Mr. Simpson said he had grown up in Winchester but had not lived here in 15 years. He thought he was doing the right thing in fixing up the home. He does not live in the house right now due to personal circumstances. Vice Chairman Bandyke asked questions about the roofing, front door and paint colors. The Board decided to make separate motions for the windows and remaining items.

*Vice Chairman Bandyke made two separate motions for **BAR-15-310**.*

*Motion #1- To approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR-15-310** for the following:*

- *Roofing materials and paint colors as submitted.*

Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Ms. Schroth abstained.

*Motion #2-The Board denied a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR-15-310** for the following:*

- *The vinyl windows are inappropriate for use in the Historic District.*

Mr. Serafin seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Ms. Schroth abstained.

OLD BUSINESS:

BAR-15-285 Request of Jeff Davis on behalf of Shenandoah University for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof at 203 South Cameron Street.

Mr. Davis spoke about the project to replace the roof. He stated that he had sent in a paper about the work that was going to be done. The replacement will be 24 gauge standing seam metal. He had not decided on color pending the decision of the Board. Vice Chairman Bandyke noted the pictures submitted had applied cap and drip edge rather than turn with a ridge vent. Mr. Davis said there would not be a ridge vent. There is a trim piece that will go up. It looks like a vent cap but it is not. Chairman Rockwood said the seam on the roof portion replaced eight years ago appeared to have a higher seam than standard with no cap. Mr. Davis said at the top of the roof it does. But it cannot be seen unless you are on the roof. Mr. Davis said if the Board did not have a choice of color than he could either match it to the old roof or give it a new color.

*Mr. Walker made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR-15-285** as submitted. Vice Chairman Bandyke seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0.*

BAR-14-636 Request of Richard & Sarah Bell for Certificate of Appropriateness for style of board and batten siding and paint colors.

Mr. Bell spoke about the style and colors of board and batten siding they were going to use on the addition to the house. Chairman Rockwood asked if Hardi-plank had been approved and Mr. Bell said it had previously. Mr. Bell said the lap siding created too many horizontal lines and what they had chosen would work much better.

*Vice Chairman Bandyke made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR-15-636** as submitted. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0.*

BAR-15-233 Request of Richard Hunt for demolition of a shed and build a gazebo and workshop at 438 North Loudoun Street.

Mr. Hunt reviewed the materials he planned on using for the new workshop. The windows would be wood instead of vinyl. The trim will match the house. Chairman Rockwood asked if the windows would have "ears" on them. Mr. Hunt said they would be on top of the windows. Chairman Rockwood asked if there would be divided lights and Mr. Hunt said he would have to put mullions in himself to turn it into a four panel window. He is also going to make the doors himself. He also explained the details of the

location of the shed, re-grading the yard around the buildings and the distance from the house to the new buildings.

The Board asked questions about the location of the windows and doors on the shed and whether they are visible to the public. There was discussion about availability of purchasing windows versus hand-making them and different styles of windows.

*Vice Chairman Bandyke made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to **BAR-15-233** to build a shed according to plans submitted. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0.*

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Hunt asked about returning with his future plans for the gazebo. The Board said he could make another application for it when he is ready.

ADJOURN:

With no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 5:30pm.