

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW MINUTES

The Board of Architectural Review held its regularly scheduled meeting on Thursday, September 15, 2016, at 4:00pm in Council Chambers, Roush City Hall, 15 North Cameron Street, Winchester, Virginia.

POINTS OF ORDER:

PRESENT: Chairman Serafin, Vice Chairman Walker, Mr. Chasler, Ms. Jackson, Mr. Packard, Ms. Schroth

ABSENT: Ms. Elgin

STAFF: Josh Crump, Jacquelyn Mathes, Erick Moore, Tim Youmans, Tyler Schenck

VISITORS: Mike Grabowski, David Look, Terry Frye, Richard Till, Maral Kalbian, Jim Burton, Dorris Perry, Onofrio Castiglia

Chairman Serafin called for corrections or additions to the minutes of September 1, 2016. Ms. Jackson made a motion to approve the minutes from September 1, 2016. Mr. Walker seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the motion passed 5-0-1 (Mr. Chasler).

Vice Chairman Walker made a motion to amend the Agenda to add public comments. Ms. Schroth seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0.

CONSENT AGENDA:

None

Chairman Serafin opened the floor for public comments for any case other than 22 E. Monmouth Street, as that will have its own public hearing.

Maral Kalbian addressed the Board regarding **BAR 16-543** to demolish the structure at 200 North Cameron Street.

Ms. Kalbian stated that she is concerned because she had read in the newspaper and other sources questioning whether the building was historically significant. She said that it is significant because it is a contributing resource in the Winchester Historic District, as approved in 2014.

Ms. Kalbian mentioned that the building is already certified as an historic building by the Department of Historic Resources, the State Review Board, The Historic Resources Board, and the National Park Service. However, she feels as though

the Board may “write it off” simply because it is not one hundred or two hundred years old.

She voiced concerns about the precedent that it would set if it was demolished. She stated that there have been several buildings around the city that have been demolished that she believes shouldn't have been and many of them have occurred by governmental agencies or pseudo governmental agencies.

Ms. Kalbian thanked the Board for their time and took her seat.

Jim Burton, from Carter & Burton Architects, also addressed the Board regarding **BAR 16-543**

Mr. Burton stated that he has a proposal in with the City to preserve this building and build a Patsy Cline museum and a mixed use building.

Mr. Burton emphasized that he supported the idea of removing the front of the building that is not part of the original design. That actually crowds the old brick house to the right and detracts from the original intent that was considered to be historic. He would be in favor of removing that to return it to its original design state.

Mr. Burton mentioned that he received a grant from The National Trust for Historic Preservation to do the Design Guidelines for Middleburg and he co-wrote those guidelines. His office building in Berryville has also won the fifteen year state facade award.

Mr. Burton believes that we definitely need to preserve history, stories, and buildings, especially downtown as the strip mall aesthetic is starting to pull dollars and popularity out of the downtown. “You have to treat downtown almost as your grandparents. You have to support them as they are aging and may need maintenance and help.”

Mr. Burton stated that he believes that the Board knows this is a certified historic building in an expanded district. He said there are guidelines with the 2006 Virginia State Code 15.2-2306 and it will speak to the idea that you may have to advertise for a year and offer to sell the building to someone who is willing to preserve it before you can demolish the building. So, to vote on demolishing it today may not even be legal and emphasized that “he wanted some of you all to realize that, and again I think some of you do know that.” [Sic]

He said that coincidentally in today's Washington Post [there was an article] on one of his investors who owns the company that put the new cladding on the African Museum. They want to bring their dollars to Winchester and fix things up. He stated again he wanted to build a Patsy Cline museum.

He went on to say that the owner of the George Washington Hotel called him today and said that they just won the National Hotel of the Year award again out of seven thousand hotels, and he supports him in trying to bring more vitality to that end of the town.

Mr. Burton emphasized again that, he does condone demolishing the front part that is not historic and preserving the building. He said that he has made an offer to the City to purchase the building to preserve it and if they have a different price that they need to advertise they can discuss that too.

Mr. Burton thanked the Board for taking time to listen to him took his seat.

John Miller stated that he would like to address the Board regarding 22 E. Monmouth Street. Chairman Serafin informed Mr. Miller that they will be having a separate public hearing for that specific case later in the meeting and this portion was for comments regarding any case other than that one.

Chairman Serafin closed the public comments portion of the meeting.

NEW BUSINESS:

*Chairman Serafin opened the public hearing for **BAR 16-522***

John Miller addressed the Board with his concerns for the partial demolition of 22 East Monmouth Street.

Mr. Miller said that he, as well as the neighbor next door to this project, has concerns about their plan for off street parking. He said that a few years ago the neighbor contacted Perry Engineering about making a driveway and they were told that due to the amount of rock in that area they were unable to help. Because of that they are worried that if Mr. Grabowski tries to dig out for a driveway it may cause harm to the neighbor's home.

Mr. Miller also expressed concerns regarding the timeline of this project and mentioned that this owner has several projects throughout the City that are just sitting half finished. He stated that the street is busy, parking is terrible and the homeowners on the street don't want equipment just sitting around.

Chairman Serafin closed public hearing.

BAR 16-522 Request of Mike Grabowski to partially demolish a structure located at 22 East Monmouth Street. (*Map Number 213-01-4-09*). Zoned Residential Business (RB-1) District with Historic Winchester (HW) District overlay.

Mr. Grabowski addressed the concerns of Mr. Miller.

He stated that while downtown Winchester is rocky that doesn't necessarily mean that the rock will have to be hammered. Often times they run into a lot of rock that can be excavated. That is a decision they have to make once they get in there and see how it is. He said that he will do any preservation work required to make sure that he doesn't damage the adjacent foundations.

Mr. Grabowski stated that in reference to projects that he hasn't finished, he isn't sure what Mr. Miller was referring to. He stated that he currently doesn't own any projects in town that aren't either completed or on their way to being completed. As far as the timeline, Mr. Grabowski stated that generally he is giving this a six month timeline.

Mr. Grabowski then addressed the Board and proposed renovating this home for a single family home use.

He proposed preserving the original structure and demolishing the three additions north of the original structure. He will excavate and pour a crawlspace foundation and frame a two story addition that will be the same dimensions adjoining the north wall. He would like to change the roof of the addition to a 4/12 gable style reversing into the ridge of the original structure. He would also like to demolish the existing 9'x12' shed and build a new 15'x22' garage of the same architectural style.

Ms. Schroth asked Mr. Grabowski to explain why he needed to demolish the 1920's addition of the home.

Mr. Grabowski stated that the ceiling height of the main level is right at seven feet, which is low and they need to run duct work through which will make it even lower causing code compliance issues.

Vice Chairman Walker went over the Criteria for Demolition, as stated in the Winchester Historic District Guidelines.

*Mr. Packard made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR 16-522** as submitted. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the motion passed 5-1 (Ms. Schroth).*

BAR 16-542 Request of David Look for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install exterior step railings, extend fencing and new kitchen storm window at 24 South Washington Street.

Mr. Look proposed a simple iron railing to be installed in the middle of the front steps at both the upper and lower levels. Each will consist of two verticals and a hand rail. The verticals of the upper railing will be anchored into the wooden

porch floor with screws at the top and anchored at the bottom into the brick and sealed with molted lead. For the lower and shorter railing, both verticals will be anchored into the brick and sealed with molten lead. The back porch railing will be to the right side of the brick steps.

For the fencing Mr. Look proposed an iron fence to match the existing.

Mr. Look stated that the wooden kitchen window is in good condition but has never had a storm window. He would like to install a new aluminum storm window and paint it to match the existing trim.

*Vice Chairman Walker made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR 16-542** as submitted. Mr. Packard seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0.*

BAR 16-543 Request of Cameron Street, LLC for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the structure located at 200 North Cameron Street.

Chairman Serafin recused himself.

Tyler Schenck, Interim Economic Redevelopment Director and Interim Executive Director for the Economic Development Board for the City of Winchester, came to the Board on behalf of Cameron Street Investments, LLC.

Mr. Schenck stated that the EDA has been considering redevelopment options for the Winchester Towers and as of this morning they directed him to seek BAR approval for the demolition of the structure. He said that although the structure is classified as historic, the EDA feels it is in the best interest to start new construction due to the layout of the building and what they see as a good fit for the area.

Vice Chairman Walker said that generally when the Board considers a demolition they have a proposal for what will be taking the place of the structure and asked Mr. Schenck if he had any proposed designs.

Mr. Schenck presented the Board with a very conceptual drawing of a possibility for the new structure. He did say however, that whatever is built there will be very complimentary of the surrounding structures.

Ms. Schroth asked that Mr. Schenck to clarify what was going in that space because the picture shows a hotel and convention center.

Mr. Schenck stated that EDA authorized him to draft an exclusive negotiation agreement with Glaize Properties, Inc. to potentially get a luxury boutique hotel and conference center. However, all he has been directed to do today is draft the

agreement. Once the demolition has been approved he would come back with more details on how the new structure would look.

Vice Chairman Walker asked if they have investigated alternatives to demolishing the building.

Mr. Schenck said that since they have acquired the property and even before then, they have communicated with developers throughout the Mid-Atlantic to discuss opportunities or ideas for the future of this property. They did explore the preservation and partial preservation, as well as complete demolition of the structure and at this time the EDA feels that the complete demolition of the structure is the best way to proceed.

Vice Chairman Walker stated that he believes it is in the Board's best interest to see more of a proposal on what is going there before they make a decision.

Mr. Schenk asked the Board for a timeline and what exactly the Board needed.

Vice Chairman Walker said that he believes the limit of the Boards extent of time to act on a given proposal is 60 days. As far as what they need, he the Board would like to see more conceptual renderings and further explanation on why they have ruled out saving the existing structure.

*Mr. Chasler made a motion to table **BAR 16-543**.*

Vice Chairman Walker interjected and said that "we might want to mention on the motion the reasons for tabling it."

*Mr. Chasler made a motion to table **BAR 16-543** to get a more rendering of the conceptual drawings and reasons why or why not renovating or saving the structure is not feasible. [Sic] Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0-1 (Chairman Serafin abstained).*

BAR 16-561 Request of Doris Perry for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof at 500 North Braddock Street.

Ms. Perry proposed replacing the roof of her home with slate color asphalt shingles.

*Ms. Jackson made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR 16-561** as submitted. Vice Chairman Walker seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0.*

BAR 16-564 Request of Richard Till for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof at 404 South Washington Street.

Mr. Till proposed replacing the shingle roof portions of his home with Autumn Brown asphalt shingles.

Mr. Packard made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for **BAR 16-564** as submitted. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. A voice vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0.

OLD BUSINESS:

OTHER BUSINESS:

The Board welcomed new member Bart Chasler.

ADJOURN:

With no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned 4:45 at pm