

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW MEETING MINUTES

The Board of Architectural Review held its regularly scheduled meeting on Thursday, May 16, 2013, at 4:00 p.m. in Council Chambers, Rouss City Hall, 15 North Cameron Street, Winchester, Virginia.

1. POINTS OF ORDER

PRESENT: Tom Rockwood, Tim Bandyke, Kevin Walker, Patricia Jackson, Peter Serafin

ABSENT: None

STAFF: Aaron Grisdale, Catherine Clayton

VISITORS: Kathleen McDonald, Leivi Mazariegos, Alec Bouldin

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Chairman Rockwood called for additions or corrections to the minutes of April 18, 2013. Hearing none, he called for a motion. Mr. Walker moved to approve the minutes as submitted. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion passed 5-0.

2. CONSENT AGENDA

None.

3. NEW BUSINESS

HP-13-193 Request of John P. Chesson, MD, owner, for a Historic Plaque at the property located at 101 W. Cork Street, (*Map Number 192-01-Q- -01*), zoned Central Business (B-1) with Historic Winchester (HW) District overlay.

Chairman Rockwood asked if the plaque applicants are generally present at the meeting to which Mr. Grisdale responded that generally they are in attendance. Chairman Rockwood then called for questions or comments from the Board. Mr. Walker abstained. Mr. Bandyke questioned whether the applicant is requesting one plaque for each part of the building to which Mr. Grisdale responded that typically there is only one plaque per parcel. Mr. Serafin stated that he does not consider the property as being separate. Chairman Rockwood then asked if anyone has a view on the merits of granting a plaque for this building. Ms. Jackson stated that it has been fixed nicely and is no longer an eyesore as it was. Chairman Rockwood stated that it does retain its historical integrity and value.

Chairman Rockwood called for a motion to approve at 101 W. Cork Street as application so states or 201 S. Braddock Street. Mr. Grisdale stated that the main parcel is 201 S. Braddock Street and based upon the shorter street width when you have multiple street frontages. He then advised that the technical parcel address is 201 S. Braddock Street. Mr. Bandyke moved to grant

a Certificate of Appropriateness for a Historic Plaque for the property located at 201 S. Braddock Street, citing Section 14-16, Historic Markers and Criteria for Award of Historic Markers; Section 14-6-2, Board will consider all requests for plaques using the following standards: a) classification standards of building, architectural significance, date of construction, architectural style and method of construction; b) current building inventory characteristics, appropriateness of restoration, grounds, contribution to streetscape; c) existing condition of building, present condition, appropriateness of past alterations; and d) historic architectural presence in community, present condition, appropriateness of past alterations. Mr. Serafin seconded the motion. Voice was taken and the motion was approved 4-0-1.

HP-13-252 Request of Kathleen M. McDonald, owner, for a Historic Plaque at the property located at 20 W. Clifford Street, (*Map Number 193-01-F-14- -01*), zoned Central Business (B-1) with Historic Winchester (HW) District overlay.

Ms. McDonald approached the Board. Mr. Bandyke asked if she had made any alterations or additions to the property. She stated that they removed the non-working chimney. She also advised that there have been a lot of renovations inside the house. Mr. Bandyke asked about the shed and the siding. Ms. McDonald advised of the painting that had been done and the work on the second floor deck. Chairman Rockwood stated that this is a somewhat interesting situation because there is an intact original structure and then later additions to the back and side of the house. He added that Ms McDonald has done a nice job with the restoration to the finish and painting. Ms. McDonald stated that she had the carpet removed and the hardwood floors refinished, improvements to the kitchen and bathroom, installed a new furnace and new air conditioning.

Chairman Rockwood stated that the block addition on the right gives him cause for concern. Mr. Serafin stated that the addition is haphazardly done. Ms. McDonald stated that the addition has been there for a number of years. Chairman Rockwood stated that the original building is well done but the addition on the side is done differently and from a standpoint of stating that this is historic, citing two criteria - b) current building inventory characteristics, appropriateness of restoration, grounds, contribution to streetscape; c) existing condition of building, present condition, appropriateness of past alterations, it is difficult to say that it is. Additionally, whether it is appropriate is not when it was put on but whether it is appropriate to the original house.

Mr. Serafin commented that the addition is a flat roof but it is not really a sunroom addition. Ms. McDonald stated that it is useful. Additionally, Chairman Rockwood state that the awarding of a plaque is to the historic integrity of the structure not how well it is manicured. Mr. Bandyke stated that the City of Winchester Architectural inventory states that the house is of historic significance and that the addition detracts from it. He then stated that he shares the same concerns and added that, in his opinion, the addition on the right side detracts from the historic integrity of the house.

Mr. Walker stated that it was a 1950's addition. Mr. Bandyke added that the age does not necessarily qualify a house for a historic plaque. Mr. Walker then stated that the question is not necessarily the age but rather the appropriateness. Chairman Rockwood stated that the plaque signifies a quality of the structure and architectural integrity. An addition can disqualify and this

addition is not a sympathetic addition to the original structure. Mr. Bandyke stated that Mr. Walker pointed out an important point, that being, the historic architectural presence in the community, present condition, and, importantly, the appropriateness of past alterations. Mr. Serafin stated that the addition is an inappropriate addition to the original 1920's house. Mr. Bandyke stated that the Board is trying to be as objective as we can but still be subjective.

Chairman Rockwood called for a motion. Mr. Serafin moved to deny a certificate of appropriateness stating that the addition is not appropriate. Mr. Bandyke seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion to deny the awarding of a historic plaque passed 5-0.

The Board then advised Ms. McDonald of her right to appeal the Board's decision.

BAR-13-208 Request of Leivi Mazariegos for a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of hand rail at the property located at 201 E. Boscawen Street (*Map Number 193-01-W-5- -01*), zoned Central Business (B-1) with Historic Winchester (HW) District overlay.

Chairman Rockwood stated that the hand rail has already been installed. Mr. Grisdale stated that most of it has. Mr. Bandyke stated that he did not feel that it is appropriate to the house but with some modification it could work. Chairman Rockwood then asked Mr. Mazariegos why he put the railing on the porch. Mr. Mazariegos stated that he put the railing on for safety reasons and that he is trying to avoid any unforeseen problems.

Chairman Rockwood then asked if Mr. Mazariegos installed the railing or if the landlord had. Mr. Mazariegos stated that he did with the landlord's consent. Mr. Serafin asked if Mr. Mazariegos could use the example from the railing project at 25 W. Piccadilly Street as a template. Mr. Walker stated that that would be in concert and not as costly. Chairman Rockwood stated that he could modify what has already been done if Mr. Mazariegos is willing. Chairman Rockwood then suggested to table this case and to have Mr. Mazariegos produce a drawing that shows the railing like the model; therefore, this would afford the Board the opportunity to approve the request. Mr. Mazariegos asked the Board if he had to remove the railing to which Chairman Rockwood responded no, just modify the drawing and come back to the Board with an acceptable plan at the next meeting.

Mr. Bandyke and Mr. Walker stated that they would meet with Mr. Mazariegos after the Board meeting to assist him and further explain what needs to be changed.

Chairman Rockwood then called for a motion. Mr. Bandyke moved to table the request to have Mr. Mazariegos return with modified plans. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. Voice vote was taken and the motion to table passed 5-0.

BAR-13-248 Request of Alec Bouldin, Shandlin Properties, LLC, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition, new garage doors, siding, windows, doors, and paint at the property located at 110 W. Monmouth Street (*Map Number 192-01-T-7- -01*), zoned Residential Business (RB-1) with Historic Winchester (HW) District overlay.

A brief discussion was made between the Board and Mr. Bouldin concerning setbacks and Mr. Bouldin briefly explained the project and advised that the bump out is already completed. Mr. Serafin stated that the drawing of the garage doors is drawn grossly out of scale and that it would be helpful to see a properly scale drawing.

Chairman Rockwood stated that the Board could approve the bump out and the applicant could come back with proper elevations of the garage doors.

Mr. Bandyke moved to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the modified addition to the back of the house as submitted and to have the garage elevations drawn to scale and resubmitted at the next meeting for approval on its own. Mr. Serafin seconded the motion. Voice vote was made and the motion to approve the modified addition only passed, 5-0.

4. OLD BUSINESS

BAR-13-59 Request of DFC Architects, PC, on behalf of subject property owner Piccadilly Mansion, LLC, for approval of the decking/railing at the property located at 25 W. Piccadilly Street (*Map Number 173-01-F-9*), zoned Central Business (B-1) with Historic Winchester (HW) District overlay.

Chairman Rockwood called for questions or comments from the Board. Mr. Walker moved to grant a certificate of appropriateness to BAR-13-59 as subsequently submitted. Mr. Serafin seconded the motion. Voice was taken and the motion passed, 5-0.

5. OTHER DISCUSSION

- Correspondence and nomination form from the Commonwealth of Virginia, Department of Historic Resources, for the Fort Loudoun Site to be added to the National Register of Historic Places.

Mr. Grisdale explained the request and stated that any comments the Board may have can be submitted to staff by the 19th of June and then staff would forward on as appropriate. Chairman Rockwood stated that there are missing pages. Mr. Grisdale advised that he would scan and email to Board members.

- Color Palettes

Chairman Rockwood suggested that the Board table this topic until next meeting. Mr. Bandyke stated that he also would like to table.

6. ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made and seconded for adjournment at 5:25 p.m. Motion carried by unanimous vote.