

**WINCHESTER TREE COMMISSION
MINUTES
August 23, 2012**

The regularly scheduled monthly meeting of the Winchester Tree Commission was held on Thursday, August 23, 2012 in the Conference Room at City Yards.

Mr. Patrick Farris, Tree Commission Chair, called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

T'ai Roulston made a motion to approve the June 28, 2012 minutes; seconded by Kate Christen; motion was approved by a 3-0 vote.

Members present: Patrick Farris, Mary Stickley (4:10 p.m.), Kate Christen, T'ai Roulston, Donna Downing (4:05 p.m.) and Natural Resources Advisory Board Liaison Gerald Crowell

Members absent: Allison Major

Staff present: Tom Denney, Jennifer Jenkins and Mandy Ricketts

Guests Present: Vic Bradshaw

New Business:

a.) Consideration of Tree Prune/Removal Requests:

Donna Downing arrived at 4:05 p.m.

1336 Commerce Street

Mr. Farris made a motion to remove the five trees located at 1336 Commerce Street; seconded by Mr. Roulston; motion to recommend removal was approved by a 4-0 vote.

1435 Kent Circle

Mr. Roulston made a motion to deny the removal request of the tree located at 1435 Kent Circle and revisit this location in one year; seconded by Ms. Christen; motion to recommend denial of removal was approved by a 4-0 vote.

Mary Stickley arrived at 4:10 p.m.

Mr. Denney said Mr. Farris stated he was going to vote for the motion. Mr. Denney said the Tree Commission knows what that means, but in Mr. Bradshaw's last article he quoted Mr. Farris saying the Tree Commission voted to deny and some questions came up asking if the Tree Commission makes the final vote or does the arborist. Mr. Denney said the Tree Commission needs to teach themselves to add endorse when they say they

are voting for something. Mrs. Jenkins said the Tree Commission does endorse or does not endorse her recommendation(s) since she is the arborist. Mr. Denney said the City keeps getting a lot of questions with people saying “the arborist says this but the Tree Commission says they are voting this way.” Mr. Denney said the Tree Commission needs to be more clear with the words that they use when voting to help keep things clear. Mr. Farris said he does not mind changing the way things are worded. Mr. Farris said the City code makes it pretty clear on who does what under what authority. Mr. Farris said what they are doing is making a decision following Robert’s Rules, he may suggest to keep the language of voting since the Tree Commission makes motions and seconds them. Mr. Farris said that Mrs. Jenkins is now adding her recommendations so the Tree Commission is only endorsing or not endorsing her recommendation. Mr. Roulston said it does sound a little funny because in the end, the arborist is responsible for the decision the Tree Commission makes because the Tree Commission is making their recommendations to the arborist rather than the arborist making a recommendation to the Tree Commission. Mr. Roulston said it would be a little funny if the Tree Commission did not endorse the recommendation of the arborist but Mrs. Jenkins still has the final decision in the end. Mr. Roulston said Mrs. Jenkins provides the Tree Commission with information that they use in order to make their decisions. Mr. Farris said he is thinking of the different euphuisms the Tree Commissions can use. Mr. Farris said he is wondering if it would be redundant since the arborist has the final say therefore what the Tree Commission does is almost internal. Mr. Farris said the Tree Commission votes on what they think, then that vote is taken to the arborist and she may agree or disagree. Ms. Christen said the Tree Commission should vote to recommend since that is what the Tree Commission does. Mr. Roulston said the Tree Commission makes a recommendation to the arborist and she provides information that will inform the recommendation but we do not actually endorse what she is presenting. Ms. Christen said the Tree Commission votes to recommend that the tree does get cut or the tree does not get cut. Ms. Christen said the Tree Commission is presented with a request and they recommend what we feel is right. Ms. Stickley said if she understands this correctly, the arborist comes to the Tree Commission and says a certain tree needs to be cut down, but Ms. Stickley does not think the tree needs to be cut down, that the arborist can come in the next day and cut the tree down anyway. Ms. Christen said that has been in City Code for three years now. Ms. Stickley asked why the Tree Commission even bothers with requests, and she’s sorry if that was something she missed by coming in late. Ms. Christen said Ms. Stickley is a little behind the times. Mr. Farris said the Tree Commission is an advisory body, but if there were intense difference of opinions between the advisor and the staff, then the fault line would prove something is not working right and higher authority like council would have to step in and figure out what is wrong with the system and why is it not working, then fix it. Mr. Farris said that every once in a while, the arborists’ opinion will differ from the opinion of the Tree Commission. Mr. Farris said the Tree Commission is important because it is a buffer between the public and City staff. Mr. Farris said if the City made all the decisions and someone was not happy with that decision, the City would get the full blame and that would not be fair considering the City’s staff members are professionals and they know what they are doing. Mr. Farris said it helps to have more than one voice voting on things like the John Handley High School tree removal because that shows proof of input. Mr. Farris said the Tree Commission either needs to

have recommend or endorse incorporated in their language or somehow incorporated in the minutes, that it needs to be clear as to exactly what the Tree Commission is doing. Mr. Farris said the City Code is on the website and very easy to understand. Mr. Farris said he wants to look into some other option, like the Tree Commission keeping the language the same but here are some other alternatives and review these at the next meeting. Mr. Farris said they need a point person to come up with the suggestions on what words to use when voting. Mr. Roulston said as Ms. Christen said, the Tree Commission officially makes a recommendation and as that language becomes more publically understood, the arborist has the final say. Mrs. Jenkins said the letters that she sends out have all had to be reworded to the requester. Ms. Christen asked Mrs. Jenkins if vote to recommend fits in well with the letters that are sent to the requesters. Mrs. Jenkins said yes it does. Mrs. Jenkins said the letters now say "I have reviewed your request for such and such at this location and after careful consideration and advice from the Winchester Tree Commission, your request has been either approved or denied." Mr. Farris said once you change the way things are said, it is going to be very hard to remember to say that each time. Ms. Christen said that is something the secretary can include to the minutes as well. Mr. Denney said he did not mean to open up a can of worms, but for the remainder of this meeting just continue as we have before and next meeting use the proper language.

126 South Euclid Avenue

Mr. Roulston made a motion to remove the tree located at 126 South Euclid Avenue; seconded by Mr. Farris; motion to recommend removal was approved by a 5-0 vote.

420 Fairmont Avenue

Ms. Stickley made a motion to remove the tree located at 420 Fairmont Avenue; seconded by Mr. Farris; motion to recommend removal was approved by a 5-0 vote.

513 Van Fossen Street

Mr. Roulston made a motion to deny the removal request of the tree located at 513 Van Fossen Street; seconded by Ms. Christen; motion to recommend denial of removal was approved by a 5-0 vote.

509 Van Fossen Street

Mr. Farris made a motion to deny the removal request and prune the tree as needed, located at 509 Van Fossen Street; seconded by Ms. Stickley; motion to recommend denial of removal was approved by a 5-0 vote.

393 Millwood Avenue

Mr. Roulston made a motion to remove the tree located at 393 Millwood Avenue; seconded by Mr. Farris; motion to recommend removal was approved by a 5-0 vote.

b.) Storm Summary

Mrs. Jenkins said the totals change every day for the June 29, 2012 storm. Currently, Mrs. Jenkins said the total costs for contractor cleanup work is up to \$362,435.00. Mrs. Jenkins said the City still has one week left of work to do before they take a break until November once the leaves have fallen off the trees to see what other damage has occurred that was hidden by leaves. Mr. Denney said he really believes that all of Public Works as well as our contractors have done an amazing job with cleanup. Mr. Denney said roughly 97% of citizens in Winchester were pleased with the cleanup efforts. Ms. Stickley said she has been very impressed with how fast issues were taken care of. Mr. Farris said the day following the storm while he was out picking up limbs from his yard, he saw Mr. Denney and Mrs. Jenkins evaluating trees within the City and he was very impressed with the work that was done. Ms. Christen was out of town when the storm hit but when she returned to town, she could hardly tell a storm happened. Mrs. Jenkins said the hardest hit areas were on Fairmont Avenue into the downtown area on the western side of Valley Avenue down to Bellview Avenue. Mrs. Jenkins said Courtfield Avenue, Tennyson Avenue, Roszel Road, and Academy Lane were also hit very hard. Mrs. Jenkins said there were 642 locations with storm damage that are completed, and only 52 more locations left to do. Mrs. Jenkins said when the storm hit 27 trees fell and 63 more had to be removed. Mrs. Jenkins said less than 1% of the trees pruned last year were affected by the storm. Ms. Stickley said adding an article to the website on the advantages of proper pruning would be beneficial. Mrs. Downing asked what the role of the electric company was in the storm. Mrs. Jenkins said when a tree was down with wires in it, the electric company was made aware of the situation and once the lines had been removed, the trees were able to be removed. Mr. Denney said we were not the only client of the electric company but we had a contact person and let them know daily which trees had lines in it and what locations still needed to have wires removed. Mr. Denney said that within a week, every City road was open. Mrs. Jenkins said she has received numerous phone calls about tree issues due to the storm and will present the necessary ones to the Tree Commission.

Old Business:

Mrs. Jenkins asked the Tree Commission members for their hours of volunteer work logs.

Comments from Commission Members:

The Tree Commission members thanked the City for all of their hard work and efforts that were put towards the June 2012 storm clean up.

Comments from City Staff:

No further comments from City Staff.

Comments from NRAB Liaison:

No meeting for July 2012.

Adjourn:

With no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 4:44 p.m.

**CITY OF WINCHESTER
TREE COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT FOR JULY 2012
SUBMITTED AUGUST 23, 2012**

EXPENSES and ACTIVITY REPORT: July 2012			
CONTRACTOR PRUNING	CONTRACTOR PLANTINGS	CONTRACTOR REMOVALS	TOTAL
\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$206,980.00

ACTIVITY REPORT- CONTRACTOR			
PRUNING	PLANTINGS	REMOVALS	STUMP GRINDING
Monmouth at 515 S. Stewart		on Fairmont at Fairfax	
Monmouth at 603 S. Washington - 2		306 S. Washington	
122 W. Monmouth		20 E. Monmouth	
on Monmouth, across from 217		413 Briarmont	
113 E. Leicester		329 N. Cameron	
109 E. Leicester		205 S. Washington	
on W. Leicester at 421 S. Stewart - 3		101 N. Washington	
318 W. Leicester		416 S. Stewart, 2nd from Leicester	
417 Briarmont		on Clifford at 304 S. Stewart	
711 S. Cameron		115 E. Clifford	
413 S. Kent		Wolfe at S. Stewart, 2nd from Stewart	
318 S. Loudoun		424 Jefferson	
802 S. Braddock		435 Jefferson	
315 S. Washington		439 Jefferson	
200 S. Washington		Meadow Branch b/f Mahone in median 2	
402 S. Stewart		332 W. Whitlock	
412 S. Stewart - 2		351 W. Whitlock	
on W. Pall Mall at 716 W. Washington		352 Sheridan at Handley Ave	
on W. Pall mall at 800 S. Washington		8 E. Clifford	
Wolfe at S. Stewart, 1st from Stewart		Fairmont at Fairfax	
Wolfe at S. Stewart, 3rd from Stewart		214 Molden	
Wolfe at S. Stewart, 4th from Stewart		392 Millwood Ave	
Wolfe at S. Stewart, 5th from Stewart		110 S. Stewart	
20 S. Stewart - 3		506 S. Cameron	
Leicester at 300 Shawnee		1458 Greystone Terr	

436 W. Leicester		730 Academy	
Fairmont at Fairfax		606 Tennyson	
1467 Greystone		523 Virginia	
119 S. Washington		200 N. Kent at Towers - 3	
515 S. Washington		312 S. Washington	
507 S. Kent		402 S. Loudoun, 2nd from Cecil	
12 Montague Cir		710 S. Stewart	
1455 Greystone Terr		554 Bellview	
Amherst at Stewart		306 S. Washington	
248 Parkway		440 N. Braddock	
423 W. Cecil		606 Watson	
on W. Cecil at 314 Courtfield		406 S. Loudoun - 2	
112 Roszel		302 S. Washington	
541 Courtfield, last b/f cul de sac		N. Pleasant Valley at VA Ave School	
633 Tennyson		222 E. Whitlock	
637 Tennyson		501 Jefferson	
across from 315 W. Clifford		Handley Blvd at school	
401 Handley Ave		324 Shawnee	
512 Courtfield		544 Eagle Dr., 2nd on Eagle Pl	
634 Tennyson		908 Kinzel	
602 Tennyson		916 Allen	
518 Tennyson		1005 Franklin	
605 Tennyson		536 Eagle Dr	
400 Handley on Cecil		1301 Commerce	
easement behind 1613 Whittier - brush		205 E. Boscawen	
311-317 S Cameron		629 Cedar Creek Grade	
Corner Cecil/Braddock		on Wolfe at Braddock St. Methodist	
312 S. Washington		11 N. Stewart	
125 N Washington		200 block Wolfe at Washington	
21 S. Washington, 2nd from Wolfe		1004 Woodland	
423 S. Washington		744 Maple	
W. Germain at 618 S. Washington		310 Liberty	
on Cecil at 321 S. Braddock		2436 Massanutten Terrace - 3	
5 E. Germain		20 Jackson Ave alley - 3	
112 E. Pall Mall		23 W. Bond	
6 E. Cecil		523 Fairmont	
402 S. Loudoun		101 W. Hart - 2	
on Cecil at 402 S. Loudoun		325 Tevis	
403 S loudoun		2 W. Germain	

407 S. Washington			
left of 106 E. Cecil			
423 W. Cecil			
200 S. Washington			
205 S. Washington			
408 Pall Mall			
413 Pall Mall			
419 W. Clifford			
1620 S Loudoun			
on N. Cameron at GW hotel			
619 S. Loudoun			
1612 S. Loudoun			
1508 S. Loudoun			
1504 S. Loudoun			
1412 S. Loudoun			
1408 S. Loudoun			
426 N. Loudoun			
436 N. Loudoun			
704 Stewart			
108 Academy			
21 N Stewart			
Washington & Amherst			
124 Amherst			
234 Amherst			
102 S. Stewart			
116 S. Stewart			
311 S. Stewart			
419 S. Stewart			
625 S. Stewart			
710 S. Stewart			
806 S. Stewart			
120 W. Germain			
on Germain at 621 S. Braddock			
714 Academy			
Handley Blvd at S. Stewart			
Handley Blvd, last on right b/f parking			
Handley Blvd, last on right b/f school			
Handley Blvd, 4th from school			
249 Jefferson			

509 Jefferson			
1325 Handley Ave			
1401 Handley Ave			
1633 Handley Ave			
1634 Handley Ave - 2 poplars			
1637 Handley Ave - 1 pear, 1 maple			
117 North Ave			
119 Peyton			
125 Peyton			
613 Bruce			
640 Dunlap			
612 Ewell			
7 N. Euclid			
126 S. Euclid			
906 E. Cork			
509 Bellview			
533 Bellview			
548 Bellview			
549 Bellview			
553 Bellview			
on Barr at 1716 Brandon Dr. - 2 maples			
across from 520 Barr			
1720 Reaves			
1712 Reaves			
1704 Reaves			
1110 Breckenridge Ln			
219 Sheridan			
220 Sheridan			
1423 Valley			
1309 Vanceright			
1313 Vanceright			
224 Parkway			
225 Parkway			
317 Parkway			
329 Parkway			
374 Parkway			
256 Parkway- 2 trees			
252 Parkway			
416 Shenandoah			

304 Shenandoah			
232 Shenandoah			
309 Shenandoah- 2 trees			
337 Shenandoah			
408 E Pall Mall			
262 Shawnee 2			
on Leicester near Parkway - 2			
220 Roszel			
1467 Greystone			
Shawnee Alley			
300 Shawnee			
316 Shawnee			
317 Shawnee			
262 Shawnee			
312 Shawnee - 2			
222 Liberty			
on Highland at Liberty			
2913 grace			
357 Opequon			
205 Shenandoah			
209 Shenandoah			
213 Shenandoah			
217 Shenandoah			
249 Shenandoah			
200 Shawnee			
212 Shawnee			
246 Shawnee			
251 to 261 Shawnee - 4			
250 Shawnee - 2			
932 Opequon			
1004 Opequon			
1008 Opequon			
525 E Cork on Shenandoah			
317 Opequon			
920 Opequon			
1023 Opequon on Opequon Ct.			
928 Opequon			
901 Opequon			
916 Opequon			

225 Opequon			
241 Opequon			
257 Opequon			
265 Opequon			
321 Opequon			
320 Opequon			
381 Opequon			
630 Hollingsworth Dr			
504 Eagle Dr, on Eagle Pl - 2			
540 Eagle Pl			
542 Eagle Pl			
605 Opequon Ct			
1109 Opequon			
1405 Opequon			
509 Eagle Dr.			
630 Hollingsworth at Opequon			
552 Eagle Dr			
528 Eagle Pl			
552 Hollingsworth			
622 Hollingsworth			
356 Parkway			
348 Parkway			
416 Hollingsworth			
1115 Opequon			
408 Hollingsworth			
412 Hollingsworth			
500 Hollingsworth			
556 Eagle			
436 Hollingsworth			
430 Hollingsworth			
444 Hollingsworth			
415 E Leicester			
515 E Leicester			
1 Parkview			
805 Kinzel			
804 Kinzel			
816 Kinzel			
133 Molden corner of Kinzel			
Kinzel at 119 Molden			

809 Kinzel			
1716 Reaves			
817 Kinzel			
408 Pall Mall			
413 Pall Mall			
301 Shenandoah			
236 Shenandoah			
233 Shenandoah			
237 Shenandoah			
265 Shenandoah Ave			
309 Shenandoah- 2 trees			
808 Kinzel			
809 Kinzel			
903 Kinzel on Molden			
908 Kinzel			
132 Molden			
614 National			
616 National			
618 National			
Frederick/Chestnut intersection			
505 Battle			
508 Battle			
702 Battle			
904 Kinzel			
907 Kinzel			
918 Kinzel			
922 Kinzel			
919 Kinzel			
930 Kinzel			
927 Kinzel			
939 Kinzel			
947 Kinzel			
955 Kinzel			
962 Kinzel			
1014 Kinzel			
1018 Kinzel			
1026 Kinzel			
903 Kinzel on Molden			
102 Molden			

96 Molden			
102 Molden			
921 Allen			
953 Allen			
Total: 283	Total: 0	Total: 66	Total: 0

ACTIVITY REPORT- PUBLIC WORKS			
PRUNING	PLANTINGS	REMOVALS	STUMP GRINDING
Total: 0	Total: 0	Total: 0	Total: 0